

# Memorandum

Large  
and  
ASSOCIATES

Consulting Engineers The Gatehouse 1-2 Repository Road Ha Ha Rd London SE18 4BQ ☎ 44[0]20 8317 2860 fax [0]20 8317 2859  
largeassociates@largeassociates.com

To: **Dorothy Rimmer** NII Information Officer M3185-A49

From: **John H Large** 24 March 2010

Cc: David Hoadley SCANS  
Gareth Rowlands DE&S Policy Secretariat (Submarines)

Subject: **SCANS – FOI REQUEST RELATING TO OPERATIONAL BERTH SAFETY STATEMENTS  
REPORT OF ASSESSMENT REPPIR**

---

---

Further to my previous series M3185 requests for information relating to the REPPIR off-site emergency planning arrangements in place for the berthing of nuclear powered submarines, please

- a) provide me with a *Catalogue* or *Index*<sup>1</sup> relating the documentation, etc., received by the HSE and its divisions (ie the Nuclear Installations Inspectorate, etc) in respect to Operational Berth Safety Statements for each UK operational berth at Southampton for the periods
- 1) from the issue of the Southampton Operational Safety Statement 2007, Issue 1 November 2007 to the issue of FLEET/252/008 of 30 January 2008
  - 2) thereafter to the issue of DNSR.20/17 of 29 July 2008
  - 3) thereafter to 9 April 2009; and
  - 4) thereafter to date.
- b) Please confirm or otherwise that the MoD [Report of Assessment \(RoA\) of November 2007](#) is the current issue the RoA for the purpose of the adoption and implementation of V5 SotonSafe and, if so
- 1) referring to Section 6, page 9 of the RoA is it correct to state “. . . *that the probability of any radiation emergency is less than one in 100,000 years of operation. . .* “ compared to the classified HIRE (ie the assumed basis of the publicly available RoA) which states the probability for the Reference Accident to be  $\sim 1E-05/yr$  or *not greater than 1E-5/yr*; similarly,
  - 2) on this basis, what is the source of the Section 5.1 statement of the  $1E-06$  probability of a very small containment bypass radioactive release which seems, to me at least, to

<sup>1</sup> For the avoidance of doubt by ‘*Catalogue* or *Index*’ I mean a schedule or listing of the title citation of all items of documentation raised or authored by DNSR and/or Navy Command, etc in respect to the Operational Berth Safety Statements.

have introduced a factor of 10 high over the classified HIRE assessment probability;  
and

- 3) please provide a copy of the identification and risk assessment of the fire and marine traffic hazards related to Section 3.2 c), e) and f) of the RoA; and, related to this.
  - i) please confirm or otherwise, as stated in the final para of page 2 of [Assessment of MoD Generic Plant HIRE and Site Specific Reports of Assessment, ND Div 3A Ar No 35/08 Trim Folder 4.4.1.356](#), “. . . it is judged that there are no additional hazards pertinent to these site (ie Southampton) to undermine the conclusions of . this assessment report”
- c) In account of the apparent errors of Items b) 1) and 2) foregoing, is it the intention of the HSE to require a correction and reissue of the publicly available Report of Assessment?

In your response it would be helpful if you refer to my order of itemisation above.

To avoid unnecessary duplication of effort, you should note that I have already requested similar information on my Item a) above from your colleagues at DE&S Policy Secretariat (Submarines) – see [M3185-A47](#)<sup>2</sup> - and at Navy Command – see [M3185-A48](#).

---

<sup>2</sup>

<http://www.largeassociates.com/3185%20SOTONSAFE/M3185-A47.pdf>